

First Generation Vs Second Generation: Identity Clash Analysis of Pakistani Diaspora in Iram Haq's *What Will People Say?*

Nanda Nabilla Hamzah¹

Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

Nanda.hamzah15@mhs.uinjkt.ac.id

Abstract

This research is based on a qualitative study of identity clash of the first and the second generation of Pakistani diaspora in *What Will People Say* movie. The study aims to discuss the multifarious different behaviors shown in the movie in which represented by the Parents as the first generation diaspora and the Child as the second generation diaspora. The meaning and social belonging are established in this context is then analysed. By using Hall's representation and identity theory, some of the general social and cultural processes which influence both generation as individuals and as a minority group are then illustrated by the behaviours that subsequently create their identity. The study shows that the different behaviours between the first and the second diaspora generation that occur in the movie is inevitable. The first generation is strongly value the cultural feature of their homeland, meanwhile the second generation slowly but surely forgetting her roots as a Pakistani.

Keywords: Pakistani diaspora, identity, identity clash, cultural representation

A. INTRODUCTION

At its simplest, the word "diaspora" is defined as the dispersal of a people from its original homeland (Butler, 2001, pp. 189). Thus diasporas are multi-generational, for they combine the individual migration experience with the collective history of group dispersal and regenesis of communities abroad. Understandings of the diasporic condition may vary both within and between diasporas. At one point, diasporans may wish to be absorbed into their new environment, but when they attach to their dispersion a particular significance that merits enduring loyalty, they attempt to remain distinct from the 'others' – as a diasporic community (Ben-Rafael, 2013, pp. 1). Additionally, they continue their connection with their country origin, their homeland, as an attempt to maintain their representation. This is showed exactly at how Pakistani immigrants are struggling to integrate into Norwegian society and trying to be dedicated to both their family's based Islamic culture and culture of Norway in *What Will People Say* movie.

What Will People Say (2017) is a film directed and written by Iram Haq, a director of Pakistani immigrants born and raised in Norway. The film is a personal experience of a director who lives with two foundations of identity, a Pakistani and Norwegian. It tells about the life of a 16-year-old teenager born from a Pakistani family who settled in Norway. A teenager named Nisha, she received conservative education and tradition from her family which puts her under pressure to uphold Pakistani identity, beliefs and principles. She has to obey all the rules that parents believe regarding how to dress and socialize. This is inversely proportional to the desire of Nisha as a teenager who fully has an identity as a Westerner (Norwegian). Nisha wants to live like a Norwegian teenager, go to parties, wear clothes that she likes, have lovers and be independent, while her father has a stigma that western culture is not good for his family.

However, the conflict begins after her father saw Nisha and a man in a room. Her father thought they had sex and he was mad and ended up physically abusing Nisha and her boyfriend. The incident sends Nisha to a child protection center. Further, she is expelled and not recognized as a family member in her family because her parents are mad and ashamed of their daughter's affair. One day she was tricked by her mother who asked her to go home only to be kidnapped by her father and forced to live in Pakistan with her aunt and grandmother. Having trouble of being exposed to the distinctive cultural display, she attempted to run away and return to Norway several times though that it remains failed. Nonetheless, as the time goes by, she begins to accept the reality and surrender with the situation. But the conflict does not stop there, Nisha happens to have a romantic relationship with her cousin and they are caught kissing by a security officer. This act is considered to be shameful in Pakistani culture, so her family sends her back to her father in Norway. All these conflicts undergone by Nisha and her parents are deeply rooted with the different cultural exposure between the generations. The parents are trying to maintain their Pakistani cultural value in the new homeland of Norway which is always remains foreign to their child, Nisha. Therefore, through this study attempt to uncover the identity clash between Nisha representing as a second generation and her parents representing as a first generation.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

Hall's Identity and Representation Theories

Identity is an adaptive and ever-evolving production which is formed through interactions between self and society. It can be formed from our ethnicity, nationality, community, sexuality, social class, and gender. Respectively, Hall divides identity into two particular positions. First, identity is identified as one shared culture. It is a sort of collective 'one true self' hiding inside many other 'selves' which people with a shared history and ancestry hold in common (Hall, 2014, pp. 223). Having the same shared culture makes one and two people bounding into the same mindset and role of society. On "The Work of Representation: Cultural Representation and Signifying Practices" he points out that member of the same culture must share concepts, and ideas which enable them to think and feel about the world in roughly similar ways and thinking themselves as 'system of representation (Hall, 1997, pp. 4). Second, identity concept refers to a matter of 'becoming' as well as of 'being' that undergo constant transformation (Hall, 2014, pp. 225). Thus, identity can be recognized over two perspectives; identity as unchangeable thing, and identity as dynamic thing (Woodward, 1997, pp. 12-13). Further, he explains that identities are the position which the subject is obligated to take up while always 'knowing' that they are representations to the subject processes which are invested in them (Hall, 1996, pp. 19).

Hall's theory about representation and identity above will be linked into the story in *What Will People Say?* movie to show that the act of Nisha's parent to educate their children representing their identity as Pakistani eventhough they are actually living and raising their children in Norway. Living in western country do not makes them losing their identity as they are the first generation who do the diaspora from Pakistan to Norway. Meanwhile, as the second generation, their child namely Nisha (the main characterin the movie) has adopted the Norwegian culture and way of thinking. She loves acting as Norwegian more than as Pakistani . This fact is going to be the main topic that

will be analyzed in this paper and prove that second generation of diaspora do not have the same courage to maintain their origins identity as the first one does.

C. METHOD

This research employs a qualitative method. Further, the descriptive approach is implemented by using Iram Haq's *What Will People Say* (2017) movie as its main instrument. The movie is 01: 46: 49 minutes long with some specific scenes as well as utterances that will be investigated. Moreover, the data is collected through two main steps; watching the movie for several times as well as taking notes to what is essential. After collecting the data, I make an analysis related to the issue identity clash by using Hall's theories of identity and representation.

D. Findings and Discussions

1. First Generation

a) Maintaining family reputation

For Pakistani families, reputation is very important for individuals and their families. Because in general, Pakistani will not think individually, they will not think about their image and reputation. Instead, they will pay attention to the image and reputation of their family, if there is one family member who is bad or damages the reputation it will then create a difficulties for the whole family. This is proven in the movie when Nisha's father ordered Nisha to jump and kill herself because he had been mad and feel ashamed about his daughter behavior. He felt that he was better not to have a daughter than he had a naughty daughter who flirt with any boys giving her virginity as how western woman does.

As a Muslim immigrant, Nisha's father had felt disappointed because he failed to educate his daughter to have good behavior as how Islam teachings. He also felt ashamed of Nisha's actions who did not represent a Pakistani woman but a western one. His identity as the true Muslim Pakistani person had been tainted because of his daughter shameful actions. Thats why, he would rather kill his own daughter than to live with shame in his life. This act is well-

known as an honor killing practice. Thus, Nisha's father, who forced his daughter to kill herself for defending his identity as true Islam Pakistani person, represents that even he is living in a Norway for a long time, he is still maintaining his origins culture in a very hard way.

Other than that, at the end of the movie it is shown how the parents denied altering their life styles to fit the model of the West and decided to keep up their cultural background by engaging their daughter into arranged marriage. Prevalently, in Pakistan a majority of marriages are arranged and women have little say in whom to marry with (Malik, 2006, pp. 13). It is also deployed when they choose the partner for Nisha without her consent and she ended up run away releasing herself from the pressure.

b) Maintaining Pakistani practices; dress code and language

More than covering our body and sheltering it from the influences of nature, dress has meaning and is deeply connected with identity. The way we dress tells a story about who we are, allowing us to be recognised. In traditional Pakistani dress, they usually wear a veil that called as *salwar kameez*, the *dupatta*, the shawl whose varieties might reach a length of up to three meters and a width of one and half (Ivanescu, 2014, pp. 41). In the movie, Nisha's mother is someone who still maintain her origins identity as a true Pakistani. She dresses conservatively and not showing much of her skin. One time when she asked Nisha to bring something for his father, she also ordered her wear closed dress because she thinks that it is more appropriate.

Other than that the dress code, both of Nisha's parents are in fact unable to speak Norsk. This seems to be a greater challenge with rearing socialization outside their private space. It can be seen in a specific scene where Nisha's parents had to bring his eldest son, Asif at the meeting with Child Welfare.

01: 26: 38 The Staff : We are curious, why are you here Asif? (Speaking in Norsk)

01: 26: 41 Asif : I'm here to translate. (Speaking in Norsk)

- 01: 26: 47 Mother : Please tell them (the staffs) we only want the best for our daughters. (Speaking in Urdu to Asif)
- 01: 26: 50 Asif : My mom says we only want the best for Nisha. (Speaking in Norsk to the staff)

Being a as Muslim immigrant in the Western hemisphere poses quite a challenge in term of adaptation with the new culture (Zaidi and Shuraydi, 2002, pp. 495). This shows the difficulty of Nisha's mother as an immigrant to acculturated with Norway culture and instead of trying to learn she prefer to stick with her mother tongue.

2. Second Generation

a) Smoking in public

Female smokers are usually stigmatized as naughty, free women and attached to other negative view, especially when it comes to Pakistani culture. Therefore, what happen with Nisha is quite controversial, despite of living behind a conservative Pakistani family that hold a strong value to their culture, she smokes ciggarates. If only she did the thing in front of her parents they would, in no doubt, punish her badly for her behaviour.

b) Clubbing

According to Nisha's mother statement, dancing in front of people is considered inappropriate in Pakistan culture, especially when it comes to woman who dance in front of a man. In this specific issue, Nisha's mother complaining to her husband for inviting her dancing in front of their fellow Pakistani relatives. Nisha, on the other hand, showing her disapproval of the culture which, in her opinion, was considered ridiculous. However, it does not stop there. On the following scene, unsurprisingly, Nisha is dancing in the Club carelessly, shamelessly with a boy.

c) Inviting Man to Her Room

In Islam there is a fundamental boundaries between male and female. Islam establishes a number of criteria for association between men and women to maintain honor, protect their dignity and holiness. The criterion also serves to prevent adultery. Among other things, Islam forbids mixed with men and women in one place). This value is tightly hold on by Nisha's family, specifically his father and mother.

Things begin to be a lot more chaotic for this family when Nisha, intentionally, bringing his boy friend into her bedroom. Further, she even flirts with the boy and almost having a sexual intercourse, Nisha's father however manage to find out his daughter behaviour and beat up both of the teenagers mercilessly. It is shown that Nisha, despite raised in the Muslim family, is nothing like her parents who value their religion and cultural background.

d) Not Praying

In being a Muslim, the followers should follow what Islamic teachings and what Holy Qur'an as well as Hadits says (Moore, 2016, pp. 2). For Muslims, the five daily prayer times are among the most important obligations. Prayers remind the faithful of God and the many opportunities to seek His guidance and forgiveness. They also serve as a reminder of the connection that Muslims the world over share through their faith and shared rituals. However, growing up in western exposure, Nisha, boldly and carelessly, leaves her obligations to take a pray five times a day.

Nisha is contradictory with her parents who still show their identity as Muslim, there is no single scene in the film that shows Nisha is carrying out her obligations as a Muslim to carry out prayers. Moreover, Nisha several times seemed ignore her fundamental obligation as Muslim to pray. At this point, we can clearly see how Nisha is actually slowly forgetting her own religion. Thus, sometimes, it makes us question whether or not that Nisha is still consider herself as a Muslim.

D. CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTION

From above analysis it can be concluded that the contradiction which exist between the first and the second generation of Pakistani diaspora in Norway is inevitable. The representation of the first generation of Pakistani diaspora in which represented by the Father and the Mother shows that it does not matter how far they live away from home country they still respect and perform their cultural and religion values and features as in home country. Furthermore, they also try their best to maintain those features and pass it to their children, as a second generation, in attempt to keep their cultural identity.

In the contrary, the mixture of east and west culture has influenced the second generation's, particularly Nisha's, identity in a complex kind of way which further effect her behaviour towards private and social life. First, it is very certain that Nisha fits herself into the western culture than eastern culture. It can be seen at how Nisha's demeanor that perfectly portray a juvenile delinquency that is unacceptable in Pakistani culture. Second, Nisha has to deceive the family into a good child who obeys the rules and adheres to the principles of eastern culture, even though there is an element of compulsion in carrying it out. However, at the end of the day she failed miserably.

REFERENCES

- Ben-Rafael, E. (2013). *Diaspora. Current sociology*, 61(5-6), 842-861.
- Butler, K. D. (2001). Defining diaspora, refining a discourse. *Diaspora: a journal of transnational studies*, 10(2), 189-219.
- Hall, S. (2014). *Cultural identity and diaspora. In Diaspora and visual culture* (pp. 35-47). Routledge.
- Hall, S. (1996). *Who needs identity. Questions of cultural identity*, 16(2), 1-17.
- Hall, S. (1997). *The work of representation. Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices*, 2, 13-74.

Ivanescu, C. (2013). *At home in my body: Sartorial practices of young Pakistani women in the Netherlands*.

Woodward, Kathryn. (1997). *Identity and Difference*. New York: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Malik, I. H. (2006). *Culture and customs of Pakistan*. Greenwood Publishing Group.

Moore, Diane L. (2016). *"Islam" Pluralism project and Religious Literacy Project*. Cambridge: Harvard University.

Zaidi, A. U., & Shuraydi, M. (2002). Perceptions of arranged marriages by young Pakistani Muslim women living in a Western society. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, 495-514.

